| **Student Name:** Audrey Lai |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that countries with ageing populations should significantly relax requirements for immigration instead of incentivising birth |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 7 minutes’ long.]  In the call-out, actively point out that the Opp had zero defence of their pro-natalist policies!   * It won’t matter if immigration policies are flawed, when natalist policies are not even effective.   On whether or not these foreign workers are paying taxes:   * We should’ve pointed out this makes little sense because people who are issued work visas will all have disposable income and actively pay taxes to the state.   + What Opp is actually referencing are refugees, which are an entirely different group to economic migrants. These people will be accepted based on an entirely different set of policies. * On children not being able to pay taxes anyways, highlight the massive tax burden of Opp’s natalist policies and point out what actually happens when we don’t immediately plug the problem of an ageing population.   + Explain that we need a large amount of income tax to supplement pension payouts, and if we don’t have enough workers now, the entire social service system will collapse and there will be massive human costs.   Reframe this whole “low-skill workers are harmful” comparative:   * If your society is already lacking workers, then even low-income workers are a net addition to your economy as opposed to not having enough workers to begin with. * Then explain that ageing societies are in dire need of low-skilled workers.   + We eventually analysed this in your arguments, good job!   On using immigration to solve the labour issue, it isn’t clear why a regular immigration policy wouldn’t be able to achieve any of this!   * Surely, the Opposition can also give out work visas based on what the economy needs. Focus on the delta which is that you allow high volumes of people in. * What if these migrant workers leave you? We need to engage with the Opposition claiming that our solution is only temporary in nature!   + Actively propose that we can provide incentives to remain there permanently, so they can be naturalised and replace our population loss.   When we’re questioning if people will actively respond positively to natalist policies:   * We’re not actively explaining why they will not respond positively! If it’s just high costs of living, why can’t the Opp just offer a high enough financial incentive? * Bear in mind that this creates a tension with Emma’s 2nd argument on coercion which implies that natalist policies will be extraordinarily effective to the point where people are forced to have children!   Please offer more POIs today!  7.34 - Watch for time! | | | | | | |